

The Holy Spirit in Biblical Teaching, through the Centuries, and Today, by Anthony C. Thiselton. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2013. xiii + 578 pp. \$46.00.

Throughout the twentieth and early twenty-first centuries, the Holy Spirit has occupied a central position in theological scholarship. The rise of the Pentecostal and Renewal Movements (the latter being the preferred term for what is popularly called the “Charismatic Movement”) in the twentieth century not only brought the Holy Spirit to the center of theological discourse, but has and continues to generate significant controversy regarding the work of the Third Person of the Trinity, particularly in the individual believer and the Church. Discussion concerning the Holy Spirit has produced a continuously growing body of literature that is increasingly complex.

The renowned evangelical theologian Anthony Thiselton, who recently retired from the University of Nottingham (U.K.), has skillfully assembled this seemingly insurmountable material into a helpful compendium that guides the reader through the exegetical, historical, and contemporary issues related to pneumatology. Although Thiselton interacts almost exhaustively with all of the relevant topics of scholarly discussion, his central thesis is that despite the general characterization of Pentecostals as elevating experience over scholarship to the point of disdaining all appeals to the intellect, both Pentecostalism and the Renewal Movement have produced a body of important theological literature that traditionalist (those who are neither Pentecostal nor of the Renewal Movement) scholars must seriously consider. Moreover, the author calls attention to the fact that work done by Pentecostal scholars has resulted in the development of a constructive self-criticism within Pentecostalism.

The work is divided into three major sections, the first of which deals with pneumatological issues in exegesis and biblical theology. Among the most noteworthy chapters here are those concerning the Spirit of God in the Old Testament (chap. 1) in which Thiselton observes not only a relationship of the Spirit to certain specific individuals, but one between the Spirit and the welfare and salvation of the community, as well as a very informative chapter on how the Spirit was understood within Second Temple Judaism (chap. 2). Regarding the Holy Spirit in New Testament scholarship, two very important chapters concern the Holy Spirit in Acts (chap. 4) and the pneumatological themes in the writings of Paul (chap. 5). The former largely constitutes a review of the scholarship on such interpretive questions such as whether or not the tongues spoken in Acts chapter two were known languages or some unknown speech, and whether Luke intended Acts to be descriptive or prescriptive. The specific value of this chapter lies in Thiselton’s overview of the contributions made by Pentecostal and Renewal scholars such as Gordon Fee and Max Turner in these discussions. Chapter five outlines eight basic pneumatological themes in Paul’s writings followed by discussions on the relationship between the Holy Spirit and Christ,

the future, and the inspiration of Scripture as well as an exegetical discussion on the gifts of the Holy Spirit within their biblical context. Following this chapter is one on the more controversial themes such as prophecy.

Part Two comprises the largest section of the book. It surveys the doctrine of the Holy Spirit from post-Apostolic times to the eighteenth century. Throughout the chapters in this section, Thiselton shows that there is a tradition within Christian thought that generally anticipates many of the ideas later defining Pentecostalism and the Renewal Movements. Similar ideas were present in Pietism, which elevated subjective experience over doctrine, as did later Methodism, which Pietism substantially influenced. This extensive section gives significant examination to the place of the Holy Spirit in Trinitarian thought as well as in soteriological discussion, particularly as it relates to sanctification and divine participation. One of the points he consistently highlights when discussing the pneumatology of the Reformers is that they insisted on the Holy Spirit's work through the instrumentality of the Word. While this historical section is thorough in its treatment of the many intricate details of pneumatology, conspicuously absent from it is any mention of the Holy Spirit in the theology of the English Reformers, though the author briefly mentions Richard Hooker (1553–1600). The Reformation chapter would also have been significantly stronger had Thiselton interacted even in the most cursory manner with the pneumatology of Lancelot Andrewes (1555–1626).

Part Three continues the historical section into the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries, and terminates with personal reflections by the author. Among the most noteworthy chapters here are those in which Thiselton interacts with the pneumatology of major twentieth-century theologians such as Yves Congar, Jurgen Moltmann, Wolfhart Pannenberg, Vladimir Lossky, and John Zizioulas, and the scholarly contributions of Pentecostal and Renewal scholars such as Gordon Fee, Roger Stronstad, and Max Turner. Included in this section is sustained, critical engagement with the so-called "Third Wave" Movement. The last chapter of this section consists of Thiselton's own conclusions. While he shows considerable sympathy towards Pentecostal and Renewal scholarship, he nevertheless critiques it. For instance, Thiselton urges discussion of the Holy Spirit more within a consistent Trinitarian framework in which the Third Person of the Godhead is understood to participate in the work of the other two persons and functions within the economy of salvation to exalt Christ and apply his redemptive work. Finally, Thiselton issues a call for continued, concerted dialogue between Pentecostals/Renewal Movement advocates and traditionalists, contending that while the latter can learn much from the Pentecostal and Renewal tradition in terms of appreciating a more vital spirituality, the former can benefit immensely from incorporating into their piety the insights of long-standing Christian tradition.

Thiselton's work is nothing less than magisterial. Throughout he combines the highest standards of exegetical, historical, and systematic

theology. In keeping with his reputation, this author exemplifies the best of theological method. Moreover, while displaying exacting scholarship, he demonstrates admirable charity towards those whom he critiques, affirming the value of their work. This book serves as a substantial addition to the classic works on the Holy Spirit, such as Sinclair Ferguson's and John Walvoord's, as well as Stanley Burgess's three-volume history of pneumatology. However, this important treatise is by no means easy reading. The book is suitable for theologically educated and engaged pastors, and scholars in the field of biblical, historical, and systematic theology. It is also an ideal text for advanced seminary courses in pneumatology. *The Holy Spirit in Biblical Teaching, through the Centuries, and Today* will prove to be a classic work in theological studies as it provides a basis for further dialogue and scholarly engagement.

André A. Gazal

The Unseen Realm: Recovering the Supernatural Worldview of the Bible, by Michael S. Heiser. Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2015. 368 pp. \$27.95.

The Unseen Realm is a biblical theology of the spirit realm. It is based upon a close reading of the Bible in its ancient contexts (i.e., ANE and Second Temple texts). It grows out of the author's dissertation, published articles (e.g., in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, the *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society*, and the *Bulletin for Biblical Research*), and ministry to people who hold worldviews grounded in the paranormal, occult, and esoteric beliefs. Thus, it represents an effort to apply top-tier scholarship to biblical theology and then make this theology available to the church at large. Author Michael Heiser holds a Ph.D. in Hebrew Bible and Semitic Languages from the University of Wisconsin-Madison, and is Scholar-in-Residence at Faithlife Corporation.

Heiser begins with a two-part thesis: first, that God created both spirits and humans to image him (Gen 1:26–27), each in their respective realm, each free to love and obey God and, second, that recovering a worldview incorporating such a theology greatly contributes to understanding God, his Word, and his mission in the world.

In Heiser's view, God created humans "a little lower than the *elohim*" ["gods, spirits"] (Ps 8), but gave to humans, not to the heavenly spirits, authority over planet Earth as his royal vice-regents (Gen 1:26–27). In what may have been a case of jealousy, one of these spirits [*han-nachash* "the serpent"] tempted the first couple in an effort to thwart God's plans. From then on, the storyline of the Bible records God's progressive efforts to defeat the forces of evil and reclaim not just humanity, but all of creation for himself. A major change came when God disinherited the nations at Babel (Gen 11) because they refused to obey him. He assigned powerful heavenly spirits (*beney elim*, "sons of God") to rule