

character. (2) A good conscience shows what God has done within us..., for we cannot achieve a good conscience by our own efforts" (102).

The concluding epilogue consists of four letters Frame wrote addressing questions regarding natural law.

Frame is correct that nature is best read through the lenses provided by Scripture. Consider again his reading of the brokenness of this world. The "neutral" reading of the unnecessary pain and brutality of creation is either that God is indifferent, incompetent, or malicious. Only with reference to special revelation can we see that the curse is itself not a "natural" part of the world.

Such an explicitly biblicistic approach to natural revelation obviously raises questions about its apologetic usefulness. One's system of apologetics will have considerable bearing on the answer to those questions. To the degree that the apologist is convinced that he is obligated to forego appeals to special revelation in his apologetic, Frame's book will have little appeal. But for those who are even somewhat sympathetic to Van Til's apologetic, Frame has produced a useful little tool, one that will give the apologist a few more arguments at his disposal.

Michael P. Riley
Calvary Baptist Church, Wakefield, MI

Baptists and the Holy Spirit: The Contested History of the Holiness-Pentecostal-Charismatic Movements, by C. Douglas Weaver. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2019. xvi + 573 pp. \$69.95.

Douglas Weaver has written a most compelling and well researched study on the conflicted relationship between Baptists and the Holiness-Pentecostal-Charismatic movements from the mid-nineteenth century to the beginning of the twenty-first century. Perhaps the most significant statement in the book is its final sentence. Among Baptists, "the Holy Spirit as a shy member of the Trinity is a stereotype for those who have not read the story" (407). Beginning with the midpoint in the nineteenth century, during the Holiness era, Weaver recounts the interesting and complex narrative of various groups of American Baptists with what would become the modern Pentecostal movement. Many Baptists joined in the developing story but retained the Baptist identity becoming "Bapticalists." Readers will be surprised at those among the Holy Spirit tradition that have Baptist roots. The research contained in this volume is simply magnificent.

Weaver focuses on several main groups within the American Baptist tradition—Baptists before the formation of the Northern Baptist Convention (pre-1908), Baptists of the fundamentalist/modernist era, Southern Baptists (the largest group in the study), American Baptists (the old NBC), Free Will Baptists, and some black Baptists. Missing from the conversation, and understandably so, are international Baptists and smaller Baptist groups in the United States such as the Cooperative

Baptist Fellowship, although a few individuals from with the tradition are discussed. To have added international Baptists would have produced a much longer study.

The book lays out the story in chronological fashion, discussing thematic issues along the way and demonstrating how Baptists either embraced or rejected developing Pentecostalism. This review will follow Allan Anderson's practice of subsuming all of the Holy Spirit affirming exemplars under the title "Pentecostal," recognizing the differences across time but using the term to unite the whole. In following a chronological approach, Weaver uses the classic historical markers, the "waves" of Pentecostal development—the Holiness movement, early twentieth-century Pentecostalism, the Charismatic movement and the Third Wave of Pentecostalism to keep the storyline flowing.

While Pentecostalism, with its emphasis on biblical literalism, has been attractive to many Baptists for that reason, some Baptists rejected it as a misreading of the Scripture, at times with significant effort. However, this contrast between those who embraced rising Pentecostalism and those who didn't is what makes this study especially helpful. For example, many early twentieth-century Baptist fundamentalists were cessationists and manifested a take "no doctrinal prisoners" approach to Pentecostalism, attacking its emotionalism (403). Others such as Adoniram Judson Gordon embraced the healing movement, a precursor to Pentecostalism, and was heavily influenced by the Keswick movement. However, some independent Baptists readily embraced the emphasis on the Holy Spirit, even to the point of becoming Pentecostals themselves (e. g., William Marrion Branham of Indiana).

Weaver makes a great effort to be comprehensive in his discussion of the American scene, only occasionally dabbling in international representatives. By following the chronological approach, Weaver also has occasion to incorporate discussions of both Baptist men and women along Pentecostal lines, an important feature as Pentecostalism generally has been acceptance of women doing pulpit ministry to a far greater extent than traditional Baptist groups. Weaver shows their influence at key points in the story, such as Aimee Semple McPherson's connection to Baptist identity. She held Baptist ordination for a time, and Baptists were among her strongest supporters. This highlights one of the striking features of the book. Many will read the narrative and be surprised at the significant numbers of Baptist supporters of the Pentecostal tradition. Many within the tradition are little remembered for their Baptist roots, but Weaver reminds the reader of their theological identities, even if, after embracing some iteration of Holy Spirit identity, being a Baptist was no longer part of that identity.

Weaver's narrative is engaging and fluid, holding the reader's attention through its substantial length. Another major value in this work is that it adds to the study of the Baptist movement by discussing an aspect of its history that it is seldom, if ever, treated in standard histories. It also anticipates the twenty-first century Baptist story as it explains the increasing presence of Pentecostalism among Baptists, especially among

the Southern Baptists. For example, the father of Joel Osteen, John Osteen, shifted from the Southern Baptist world into Pentecostalism and had a significant influence in the Pentecostalization of the Convention. Joel is the pastor of America's largest church and a Pentecostal, if not in name. The church is located in the heart of Southern Baptist territory—Houston, Texas—and is filled with former Southern Baptists. Weaver includes important discussions of Jerry Rankin, and others, but the book was evidently written before David Platt led the Foreign Mission Board to reverse its prohibition of “private prayer language” and speaking in tongues in 2015. For anyone interested in a comprehensive understanding of the background to the current state of the Southern Baptist Convention with respect to Pentecostalism, this is the book to study and, as an insider, Weaver has seen a good bit of what he writes about first hand.

Strangely missing from the conversation on Baptists and the Holy Spirit is any mention of John Piper and Bethlehem Baptist Church of Minneapolis, whose openness with continuationism and whose association with Sam Storms, one-time Southern Baptist pastor from Oklahoma, now a credo-baptist Pentecostal, has been going on since the early 2000s. Between Piper, Storms, and Wayne Grudem, another Baptist not discussed in detail, Weaver omits a major tributary of Baptist/Holy Spirit connection. Despite this omission, there is plenty of substance to make this book an important read for anyone interested in Baptist history and the Pentecostalization of global Christianity.

It should also be noted that this is a history of the relationship between two identifiable theological traditions. It does not include any commentary or analysis as to whether or not the blending with or rejection of Pentecostalism either strengthened or weakened either group. It is chronological history in a clear voice. It is the most thorough, well-researched study of Baptists and Pentecostalism available and an essential read for anyone seeking a thorough knowledge of twentieth-century Baptist life.

Jeffrey P. Straub
Central Baptist Theological Seminary, Plymouth, MN

Jonathan Edwards: An Introduction to His Thought, by Oliver D. Crisp and Kyle C. Strobel. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2018. xi + 232 pp. \$19.99.

Oliver Crisp, professor of systematic theology at Fuller Theological Seminary, and Kyle Strobel, associate professor of spiritual theology at Talbot School of Theology, are two leading representatives of the British School of Edwards studies. In this collaborative work the authors provide us with an introductory survey of Edwards's thought, with particular attention given to those aspects of his thought receiving the most attention in the wider academic community.